



MATTHEW L. SCHWARTZ  
Tel.: (212) 303-3646  
E-mail: [mlschwartz@bsfllp.com](mailto:mlschwartz@bsfllp.com)

May 11, 2018

**BY ECF**

Honorable Katharine H. Parker  
United States Magistrate Judge  
Southern District of New York  
500 Pearl Street, Suite 1950  
New York, New York 10007

**Re: *City of Almaty, Kazakhstan, et ano. v. Mukhtar Ablyazov, et al.*,  
Case No. 15 Civ. 5345 (AJN) (KHP)**

Dear Judge Parker:

We represent the City of Almaty, Kazakhstan and BTA Bank (the “Kazakh Entities”). Yesterday we provided the Court with courtesy copies of the briefing from the Kazakh Entities’ motion to compel Gennady Petelin to comply with third-party subpoenas served upon him, which was just transferred back to Your Honor from the United States District Court for the Central District of California. [See ECF No. 655].

As of the time that the California briefing was completed, Petelin had refused to acknowledge whether he possessed any documents responsive to the subpoena to him. But today, for the first time since the subpoenas were served in December of 2017, Petelin has acknowledged that he is withholding responsive documents, but that he maintains his objections to producing any of them. A copy of the letter we received from counsel to Petelin is attached as Exhibit 1. In it, Petelin asserts that he has no responsive records with respect to some of the people and entities identified in the subpoena, but has other responsive records. By negative implication, among the people and entities about which Petelin has responsive records are Mukhtar Ablyazov, Ilyas Khrapunov, Triadou SPV S.A., Telford International Limited, Telford Trust, and various other people and entities that the Kazakh Entities have proven are involved in the funding chain for the U.S. investments at issue in this case.

Thank you for your consideration.

Respectfully,

/s/ Matthew L. Schwartz  
Matthew L. Schwartz